Dear Reviewers;

Thank you for your valuable comments and suggestions. We have evaluated our work and done corrections in the manuscript according to your comments and suggestions. Our explanations for your comments and questions are below.

Regards.

Sabahattin Deniz (Ph.D.)

For Reviewer B

1. “Certified reference material” has been added under section Materials and Reagents.
2. FTIR spectra was taken by ATR accessory that’s why some of peaks may appear weak. The synthesized adsorbing material is insoluble therefore we were not be able to do UV and NMR analysis. Unfortunately, Solid State NMR is not part of our opportunities and we could not do that analysis. Previously we have taken only the SEM images. After your recommendation, the elemental composition of the surface of M3APS was determined by ESEM-FEG/EDAX and the EDX data has been added in the corrected manuscript the authors are thankful for your recommendations.
3. Yes, you are right there is no any free amine group in our structure of M3APS. We apologise for that expression mistake in manuscript. We have corrected the statement about pH effect onto adsorption capacity. Thank you for that important notice.
4. A lot of heavy metals ions precipitate in alkaline solutions. Cd2+ ion also precipitate at alkaline solutions. If pH>7.4 otavite (CdCO3) is occurs by effect of atmospheric CO2. At lower pH precipitation does not occur. Some metals can be adsorbed as precipitated products. There are some literatures about that. In our study we investigated adsorption of cadmium ions because the metal ions can interact with binding sides of our adsorbent material. That’s why we have not carried out at pH values between 7-11.
5. “Adsorption Kinetics” has been changed to “Effect of Contact Time”.
6. After your comment “Effect of Contact Time” studies have been carried out with 250 mg L-1 Pb(II) and corrected figure has been added to manuscript. Thank you for your attention.
7. We have explained the content of “synthetic waste water” and “SPS-WW1 Batch 109” certified reference material as a table in the corrected manuscript.
8. Pointed part of adsorption isotherms has been rewritten using original literature.
9. We have removed “Limits of Detection and Quantification” section and Table IV from manuscript.
10. We can say that the calculation of Gibbs Free Energy of the adsorption process is not common but we encountered some of works in literature which are did this calculation. So we just want to see the results for our work. We have calculated Gibbs Free Energy of for just showing the adsorption processes of Pb(II), Hg(II) and Cd(II) on M3APS is spontaneous or not, feasible or not in nature.
11. Table V has been transferred before Conclusions, under section “Comparison with Some of Other Adsorbents”
12. We have defined the adsorption conditions below figures 4-6 in a bracket.
13. The error bars have been illustrated on each points of figures 4-6.

For Reviewer C

1. Typing mistakes has been corrected in the manuscript. Thank you for your attention.
2. We have given references for adsorption procedures which are in “introduction” section of corrected manuscript.
3. Thiamine attached silica was not prepared and used before as an adsorbent. Thiamine (vitamin B1) is a natural product and has a lot of heteroatoms (e.g. S, N, O) which can bind heavy metals on the molecule. Main advantage of modifying 3-aminopropyl silica gel by thiamine is getting silica based an environmental friendly and tough adsorbent.
4. The statement about Langmuir and Freundlich equation has been changed according to your suggestion.
5. Standard deviation bars have been given in figures 4-6.
6. We have defined possible binding sides of molecule in figure 2 and interaction between metal ions and functional sides has been explained in “effect of pH” section of corrected manuscript.
7. Adsorption amounts of metal ions has been given also in mmol g-1 in Table II in corrected manuscript.
8. Experimental and calculated Qm values was discussed in “conclusions” section of corrected manuscript.