Reviewer A: COMMENTS

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Comment | Response/action |
| (i) | It is somewhat unusual that arsenate and arsenite in soil not determined before the start of the experiment. | Total As concentration was determined in start of experiment and data is added . |
| (ii) | The authors note the determination of total organic carbon (Line 77 p.4)  Which method? Where are the results? | It was a mistake only DOC was determined, line is modified. |
| (iii) | Formula (Line 79 p.4) | corrected |
| (iv) | Space (Line 254) | corrected |

Reviewer B: COMMENTS

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Comment | Response/action |
| i) | On Fig. 3. Should be mark which results are for arsenate and which are for arsenite. | Agreed, figure is modified |
| ii) | Row 260: Instead of form should be from. | corrected |

Reviewer C: COMMENTS

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Comment | Response/action |
| (i) | In most of the literature arsenate and arsenite written as As(V) and As(III) so it better to include arsenate and arsenite complete in the text first time and then abbreviate throughout the text as As(V) and As(III). | Agreed, and modified in text |
| (ii) | Calcium Carbonate should be written complete at first place like other characteristics. | Agreed and inserted at first place |
| (iii) | I think a section naming chemical analysis should be added before statistical analysis which includes the name of instruments used for the determination of different elements. | Agreed and inserted |
| (iv) | Line 107: regress/ion  regression; Cw  cw | corrected |
|  | Line 124 to 126: sentence ending with and, indicating incomplete line | corrected |
| (v) | Line 128: Calcium carbonate  CaCO3 | corrected |
| (vi) | Tables: Table is missing in the title of table 1. | inserted |
| (vii) | Table 2 and 3 units should be written under the parameter names instead of separating them with a comma. | Agreed and modified |
| (viii) | Table 2: Use horizon instead of soil. Round off the first value of CEC (9.30 to 9. | Agreed and suggestion incorporated |
| (ix) | Figures: In figures the units should be written in the parenthesis e.g. cw (mg L-1), log xm-1 (mg kg-1) and Kf (L kg-1). | corrected |
| (x) | Figure 3: Error bars (Standard error or deviation?). | Agreed and mentioned |

,